

Book Reviews

Books and Schools in the Italian Renaissance. By Paul F. Grendler. Aldershot, Hampshire (Great Britain) and Brookfield, VT: Variorum, 1995. vii, 258 pp. \$82.50. ISBN 0-86078-455-X

This is the second volume of Paul Grendler's articles to be published in Variorum's *Collected Studies Series*. This series is very valuable insofar as it gathers articles—often published in very diverse journals and collections in both hemispheres—by specialists in medieval and early modern European history and culture, thereby making article-length publications by these specialists much more easily available. Wherever possible, the *Collected Studies Series* also maintains the original paginations of those article-length publications. Fortunately, in the case of this volume it has also facilitated the reproduction of the many fine illustrations contained in Professor Grendler's articles.

Grendler provides a good summary of the contents of this volume in his short preface (vii–viii). Articles one through four mainly focus on books, while articles five through ten concentrate on schools. The eleventh and final article (“The University of Padua 1405–1600: a success story”) argues that the University of Padua, often referred to as Europe's leading university during that period, owed its success to the enlightened policies of the Venetian government. Grendler is currently working on a monograph-length study of Italian universities (including Padua) during the Renaissance.

Turning to the articles on schools, article five (“Schooling in Western Europe”) discusses scholarship (through the year 1989) on schooling during the Renaissance, focusing principally on England, France, Italy, and Spain. Grendler makes an important point at the conclusion of this article when noting (786–787) that

Recent scholarship has opened the doors of Renaissance elementary and secondary schools. But we have barely walked into the classroom. If we linger a while, if we read the textbooks and memorize the catechisms of Renaissance children, we shall learn a great deal about Renaissance men and women.

Article eight (“Schools, seminaries, and catechetical instruction”) provides a survey of scholarly literature (through the year 1987) on education—religious instruction in particular—in Roman Catholic Europe during the early modern period.

Article six (“The organization of primary and secondary education in the Italian Renaissance”) discusses private, communal, and religious schools in Renaissance Italy. The subject matter of article seven (“What Zuanne read in school: vernacular texts in sixteenth-century Venetian schools”) is well-described by its title. Article nine (“The Schools of Christian Doctrine in sixteenth-century Italy”) and article ten (“Borromeo and the Schools of Christian Doctrine”) discuss catechism schools for boys and girls in Italy during the second half of the sixteenth century. Material presented in articles six, seven, nine, and ten—as well

as in other articles of this collection—is also to be found within Grendler's *Schooling in Renaissance Italy* (Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989), which has been reviewed elsewhere (e.g., the reviews listed in the 1990–1993 volumes of *Book Review Index*).

Turning finally to the articles on books, articles one and two discuss books that today might be considered as public library materials. Grendler notes that article one (“Form and function of Italian Renaissance popular books”) “argues that a potential reader could identify books intended for a popular, non-learned audience by their physical appearance. Popular books manifested a distinct combination of size, typeface, and page layout instantly recognized by contemporaries” (vii). Article two (“Chivalric romances in the Italian Renaissance”) offers a survey of what Grendler refers to as “the most widely read and least studied literary genre in late medieval and Renaissance Italy” (vii).

Article three (“Aldus Manutius: humanist, teacher, and printer”) places Aldus Manutius's life and rise to a famous publisher of ancient Greek and Latin writings within the context of the history of early printing. Article four (“The Erasmus holdings of Roman and Vatican libraries”), written in collaboration with Marcella Grendler, provides an extensive list of the various imprints of Desiderius Erasmus's works found at nine Roman and Vatican libraries. This article also presents brief histories of those nine libraries and discusses the fate of Erasmus's books in those libraries from the late sixteenth century onward, when his works had fallen out of favor among many Roman Catholics.

In his publications pertaining to the history of books, schools, and universities during the Italian Renaissance, Professor Grendler has used a wide array of valuable primary source materials and has also provided good surveys of relevant scholarly literature. His publications should be consulted by anyone generally interested in the history of Renaissance books and libraries as well as by those interested in the history of Italian Renaissance books and libraries in particular.

Joseph S. Freedman, Auburn University Library, Montgomery

Bede and His World, Vol. I: The Jarrow Lectures (1958–1978); Vol. II: The Jarrow Lectures (1979–1993). Aldershot, Hampshire, U.K.: Variorum, 1994. xvi, 999 pp. \$245.00 (set). ISBN 0-86078-449-5.

By the time of his death in 690, Benedict Biscop, founder of the twin monasteries of Wearmouth and Jarrow, had assembled for his community a remarkable library, acquired in part during his several trips to Rome. That library (expanded not only by further acquisitions but also by the energy and skill of a scriptorium which produced, among other masterworks, the magnificent Biblical manuscript known as the *Codex Amiatinus*) served as the foundation for the formidable learning and scholarship of St. Bede the Venerable (673–735).

The two volumes of this edition reprint thirty-six lectures given in the Parish Church of St. Paul in Jarrow since the inauguration of the series by the Reverend George Beckwith, rector of the parish from 1955 to 1964. The lectures, originally intended as a fund-raising exercise for the parish, constitute a diachronic symposium on Bede presented by the most prominent Anglo-Saxon scholars of the last fifty years. The several lectures have been published separately, most often as small pamphlets; as such pamphlets are easily misplaced in a library, to have them collected in two convenient volumes with a general index will be of great

advantage to students of Bede and of the period. The valuable introduction by Michael Lapidge (himself the lecturer in 1993) not only discusses the essays in relation to one another, but also indicates some of the points at which the re-prints contain uncorrected errors and suggests some possibilities for further work in Bedan studies.

The fact that this edition directly reproduces the original publications (except for the printing of color plates in black and white) has the usual minor advantages and disadvantages; on the one hand, the compilers have been able to maintain the original page numberings while adding a continuous pagination for the two volumes (a circumstance which should simplify using the composite index and tracing references to the separate versions); on the other hand, they have reproduced the typographic quirks of the originals. These are mostly broken letters and the like, but pages 365 and 366 both reproduce page 17 of the 1973 lecture; I have not been able to determine whether this error arises in the original or only in the reprint.

There has been considerable growth in Bedan studies since the 1200th anniversary of the saint's death—a growth attributable in some measure to the efforts of the various scholars represented in these volumes. In the midst of this increasing number of publications, however, the collected Jarrow lectures deserve particular attention; *Bede and his World* should prove to be a valuable adjunct to future work on this exemplar of monastic scholarship.

The following lectures should be of particular interest to the readers of this journal: Bertram Colgrave, "The venerable Bede and his times" (1958); Peter Hunter Blair, "Bede's *Ecclesiastical History of the English Nation* and its importance today" (1959); Dorothy Whitelock, "After Bede" (1960); R. L. S. Bruce-Mitford, "The Art of the *Codex Amiatinus*" (1967); J. D. A. Ogilvy, "The place of Wearmouth and Jarrow in Western cultural history" (1968); T. J. Brown, "Northumbria and the Book of Kells" (1971); R. A. Markus, "Bede and the tradition of ecclesiastical historiography" (1975); Per Jonas Nordhagen, "The *Codex Amiatinus* and the Byzantine element in the Northumbrian renaissance" (1977); Richard N. Bailey, "The Durham Cassiodorus" (1978); Eric Fletcher, "Benedict Biscop" (1981); M. B. Parkes, "The scriptorium of Wearmouth-Jarrow" (1982); Wesley M. Stevens, "Bede's scientific achievement" (1985); David Parsons, "Books and Buildings: architectural description before and after Bede" (1987); Benedicta Ward, "Bede and the Psalter" (1991); D. P. Kirby, "Bede's *Historia Ecclesiastica Gentis Anglorum*: its contemporary setting" (1992); and Michael Lapidge, "Bede the poet" (1993).

John William Houghton, The Mary Institute and Saint Louis Country Day School

Readers and Books in Majorca, 1229–1550. By J. N. Hillgarth. Paris: Editions du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1991. Vol. I: x, 302 pp.; Vol. II: x, 712 pp. 1200 FF. ISBN 2-222-04540-1.

Majorca might not seem to be a site where an extensive cultural study of books and libraries would be a fruitful intellectual endeavor. However, as J. N. Hillgarth points out in his first chapter on the economic and social background of Majorca, 1229–1550, in the late Middle Ages and Renaissance Majorca was a thriving center in the Mediterranean world. It was active as a major port on the trade

routes, and its commercial standing supported the presence of a professional class, especially lawyers and physicians. Majorca had interesting political and cultural links to Spain, Italy, and north Africa. This mixture produced the complex philosophy of Ramon Lull in the thirteenth century, and by the fifteenth century humanistic study was cultivated. In sum, the culture of books permeated Majorca.

Its situation as an island also makes it ideal for this type of inquiry because of the self-contained parameters that can be established for collecting documentary evidence about books and libraries. The second volume of Hillgarth's book is devoted to the publication of these documents. The extensive quantity of material more than justifies the choice of Majorca for this study. Most of the documents are inventories and library catalogues from thirty-five religious institutions, the library of the kings of Majorca, and 917 private libraries. Other documents, such as contracts for making books, costs of books and their materials, and notices about loans add further dimensions to the information about books and libraries in Majorca. Hillgarth's scrupulous editing makes the publication of these documents clear and accessible. Several indexes of persons, places and subjects, authors and works (two indexes, one devoted to works in Hebrew and Arabic), and incipits enhance the usefulness of these documents.

Although the publication of such a rich resource of documentation on late medieval and Renaissance libraries is a major achievement in itself, what makes Hillgarth's book especially valuable is his analysis in the first volume of the intellectual, cultural, social, and economic situation of Majorca at this period. Chapters two through five approach the documents in institutional and sociological terms. Hillgarth analyzes the types of libraries—religious communities, cathedral and parish churches, and private individuals—to see what kinds of books each of these categories of collections contained. For private libraries, in particular, attention is given to examining the similarities and differences in book ownership for members of different social classes. The last four chapters concentrate on the picture of Majorcan intellectual culture that emerges from the study of these libraries. He explores the impact of humanistic thought along with the continuation of traditional religious and technical literature. One chapter looks at the influence of the philosophy of Ramon Lull, a native of Majorca. Finally, Hillgarth assesses the cultural situation of Majorca in a broader European and Mediterranean context.

In the preface Hillgarth states that his aim is "to reach Majorcans in the later Middle Ages and Renaissance through a study of their books" (vii). While this focus on books and libraries does not illuminate certain aspects of the history of Majorca, such as its political fortunes, Hillgarth's approach is quite successful in providing an in-depth view of the intellectual and social situation. Using a variety of methodologies including quantitative and intellectual history, he analyzes patterns of book ownership, trends in intellectual and religious ideas, the impact of printing, and the mechanics of the book trade. Although the documents rarely reveal why the books were collected and the extent to which they were read, the collective assembling of this extensive body of evidence provides a broader context in which these questions can be addressed. This book exemplifies the importance of publishing these records of library history and the significant link between libraries and culture that a cross-disciplinary study of these documents produces.

Karen Gould, Austin, Texas

Private Libraries in Renaissance England. A Collection and Catalogue of Tudor and Early Stuart Books. Edited by R. J. Fehrenbach and E. S. Leedham-Green. Binghamton, N.Y.: Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, 1992, 1993. Vol. I, *PLRE* 1-4: xxiii, 321 pp. \$28.00. ISBN 0-86698-099-7; Vol. II, *PLRE* 5-66; xxiii, 282 pp. \$28.00. ISBN 0-86698-151-9.

Forty years ago Sears Jayne offered the pioneering study *Library Catalogues of the English Renaissance*, and much scholarly investigation of various areas of that very large field of study has followed. *Private Libraries in Renaissance England (PLRE)* is an ambitious attempt to publish the contents of catalogues and inventories, with identifications of individual books. Volume one at hand, *PLRE* 1-4, lists collections attributed to Bishop Richard Cox, Sir Edward Stanhope, Sir Roger Townshend, and Sir Edward Dering. Of these collectors, Dering's library was the largest, with at least two thousand volumes "probably representing more than that number of titles" (I, 146). This notable library ranks in size with those of John Rainolds of Corpus Christi College, Oxford; John, Lord Lumley; and Sir Edward Coke. Volume two at hand, *PLRE* 5-66, presents inventories of sixty-two Oxford figures, these being probate inventories of the Vice-Chancellor's Court at Oxford. A compact disk database is projected, which will publish the accumulated records of books together with records from other sources—a noble enterprise. The volumes printed offer indexes of a generous sort: Authors and Works, Editors, Compilers, Illustrators, Stationers, Places of Publication, and Dates of Publication. There is also considerable commentary on the contents of individual libraries, although full identification of the collectors is not always made. Thus Bishop Richard Cox is shown to have had strong interests in Swiss and German theological writings, as one would expect from a Marian exile who spent time at Frankfurt, then likely Strassburg and Zürich, and Worms. Cox was also one of the royal visitors to Oxford who purged the libraries, including the university library. His influence as Chancellor of the University was great, but not always benign; and he was thus known not so much as the chancellor but as the "cancellor" of the university. There is little indication in his books to reflect the Erasmian humanism that was stirring Oxford in the mid-1520s, when Cox incorporated the B.A. (1525) and M.A. (1526). Indeed, as the editor comments, "Remarkably enough no Erasmus appears among Cox's books listed here" (I, 5). Cox, to give him one final backward glance, may well have been suspicious of manuscripts: "Here are no *belles lettres*, no poetry, no rhetoric, none of the ancient historians, dramatists, or philosophers, certainly no natural philosophy, almost nothing except a little English history . . . and two books on newly explored territories . . . that suggests reading for pleasure or for curiosity's sake. All is for use." (I, 6-7).

In any case, Cox, the purger of libraries, is scarcely a figure in whose writings or libraries one would look to find humanist strengths. Rather, one should look to the scholars of Corpus Christi College: Claymond, Jewel, Rainolds, and Hooker, none of whom are represented in these volumes. One must observe that we do possess lists of the books of Richard Fox, Bishop of Winchester and founder of Corpus Christi College: first, of those books that in 1499 he gave to the collegiate church of Bishop Auckland, Durham; but more notably the books he willed to his college, Corpus Christi, at his death in 1528. That collection willed to Corpus Christi was a rich one, which to an extraordinary degree reinforces the provisions for humanist studies provided in statutes of 1517, supplemented in 1528, as I have detailed in a forthcoming study. But this is as far as one can

go in offering conclusions about the formation of libraries in England during the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries.

A hundred lists will follow these sixty-two Oxford lists; one looks forward eagerly to further *PRLE* volumes. At present, one contemplates such questions as the relative number and richness of Oxford collections as compared with those from Cambridge. One can only question the paucity of Greek texts and indeed of the writings of continental and English (and Scottish) humanists. On some future occasion it would be well to question the value of inventories and to ask how much, or how little, they tell us. Quite rightly the general editor comments:

We cannot, of course, be certain that any person read all the books listed as having been in his possession. Nevertheless, considering that the cost of books during the Renaissance, and especially in the sixteenth century, was relatively high, and that book-collecting as we know it from more recent years was not a common pursuit, there are good grounds for believing that a significant number of books recorded in private hands were actually read by the owners. (I, xvi)

One must applaud the editorial decision to publish the contents of inventories and catalogues with modern scholarly identifications; but these are not always as full as one would like, nor have the individual editors of *PLRE* attempted to close the window where absolute identification is not possible. Thus, for *budeus de mundo*, 60.64, the annotation gives only "date indeterminable." But there are, I think, only two editions of the translation by Bude: 1526 and 1541; and with a probate inventory dated 1543, either is possible. It would be helpful in such cases to be provided with the alternatives. There are other entries in which no effort has been made to provide possible dates: one such is Bricot in *naturalem philosophiam*, for Bricot wrote more than one treatise on the *Physics* of Aristotle (see Renaudet, *Préforme et Humanisme à Paris* [1953], 96–99, 132).

Likewise one must applaud the effort to clarify the sometimes illegible, often truncated and abbreviated titles in the book lists. These efforts can be immeasurably helpful to other scholars and students. But philological care must be made not to mislead: thus, in volume one, page 80, a gloss is made on a list of items sent to Norfolk, including "1 Greate dry fatt [vat] of Bookes." But this is not a vat of liquid, in the usual modern sense; rather it is the third signification given for *fat* in the *Oxford English Dictionary* as that of a cask or barrel to contain dry things. Two of the citations indicate that the term was used for a chest, as in the 1647 Wheelocke in *Letters of Archbishop Ussher*: "The Lambeth Books . . . as yet . . . remain in Fats, or great Chests." Perhaps the lesson is one of reinforcing the opening statement that *PLRE* is a "highly collaborative and complex project" and that part of the team of scholars should include a philological eye to such obsolete terminology.

One may not end on any notes of complaint, for there is much indeed to applaud. One looks forward to further volumes of *PLRE* with the confidence that they will foster studies of provenance in the books which are extant and, even more exciting, to further studies that will demonstrate how books were read and used in Renaissance England.

R. J. Schoeck, Centre for the Book, British Library

Het Nieuwe Gebouw van de Universiteitsbibliotheek te Groningen. Onder Redactie van W. R. H. Koops and Ch. J. J. Klaver. Groningen: Universiteitsbibliotheek, 1987. 108 pp. ISBN 90-367-0041-8.

Opening Universiteitsbibliotheek Groningen: Toespraken bij de Openingsplechtigheid, 20 Mei 1987: Voordrachten op het Symposium "De Wetenschappelijke Bibliotheken in de komende Decennia," 21 Mei, 1987. Groningen: Universiteitsbibliotheek, 1987. 54 pp. ISBN 90-367-0052-3.

De Wereld aan Boeken: Een Keuze uit de Collectie van de Groningse Universiteitsbibliotheek tentoongesteld ter Gelegenheid van de Opening van het Nieuwe Bibliotheekgebouw 21-Mei-31 Augustus 1987. Groningen: Universiteitsbibliotheek, 1987. iv, 149 pp. ISBN 90-367-00450.

Founded in 1615, the library of the University of Groningen (a regional capital in the northeastern part of The Netherlands) has gone through periods of success as well as neglect. Serious development and modernization began with the arrival of University Librarian Wim R. H. Koops in the early 1960s. After some twenty years of careful and deliberate planning, the new central building of the University of Groningen Library was officially opened in May 1987. In addition to the library's annual report, three attractive and informative booklets were published on the happy occasion.

The first contains brief descriptions of the history of the library and its collections, the planning background, the design and physical properties of the new building, the physical and administrative organization, as well as experiences related to the move and actual opening of the new facility. It is an excellent documentation of a complicated process.

It is altogether fitting that a symposium on the future of academic libraries was held during the festivities. In addition to the obligatory opening speeches, two formal presentations are included in the second publication. F. G. Kaltwasser of the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munchen and Maurice Line of the British Library gave their thoughtful and appropriate (in light of the new building) perspectives on the continuing role of the printed book in a rapidly changing information environment.

The exhibit of a choice selection of books, manuscripts, atlases, and maps from the library's collections was undoubtedly the highlight of the celebrations. A carefully researched and nicely produced catalog of this exhibit is indeed a fitting contribution. The 106 items, by necessity an eclectic sampling, provide an impressive and sometimes surprising view of the collections. Ranging from a celebrated thirteenth-century manuscript, the Wittewierum cloister chronicles, to an example of the work of Groningen-born graphic artist H. N. Werkman, the exhibit represents prominent examples of the development of Western culture and scholarship in many disciplines with an occasional touch on the Groningen connection.

Hendrik Edelman, Rutgers University

Print, Power and People in 17th-Century France. By Henri-Jean Martin; translated by David Gerard. Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Press, 1993. xvii, 740 pp. \$82.00. ISBN 0-8108-2477-9.

Rarely does one encounter a book with such a large quantity of information in a single volume. Originally written as the author's thesis (Paris), it was subsequently published in two volumes as *Livre, pouvoirs et société à Paris au 17^e siècle (1598–1701)* (Geneva, Switzerland: Librairie Droz S.A., 1969). Its publication embodied twenty years of research, thought, and writing by Henri-Jean Martin, noted French librarian and historian. The quality and quantity of Martin's decades of scholarship on the history and sociology of the book is significant and influential. He collaborated with Lucien Febvre on *L'Apparition du livre* (Paris: Michel, 1958), wrote *Histoire et pouvoirs de l'écrit* (Paris: Perrin, 1988), and compiled *Histoire de l'édition Française* (Paris: Fayard, 1982–1987) with Roger Chartier.

That influence has been extended to the anglo-literate by David Gerard, the translator of *Livre, pouvoirs et société à Paris au 17^e siècle (1598–1701)*, a librarian and senior lecturer in bibliographical studies, College of Librarianship, Aberystwyth, Wales. Gerard's own interests and publications on the history of the book, libraries, and the book and reading in society suit well his role as translator of the books that reached English-language readers as *The Coming of the Book* (London: New Left Books, 1976) and *Print, Power and People in 17th-Century France*. According to Gerard, his work on the latter required that the two original volumes be reduced in size by shortening the text and eliminating or incorporating some of the scholarly apparatus. Nevertheless, the book remains a formidable "read"—a straightforward exposition of absolutely everything about the book trade in seventeenth-century France. Perhaps the book attempts too much; but what would one omit? Indeed, when one considers the intense interest of what remains, one regrets that the translator has had to omit anything.

Martin immediately informs the reader that he believes one cannot "begin to understand the spirit of an age without a comprehensive idea of its book production," (xvii) and in his introduction he links the history of the book trade and publishers firmly to the history of ideas and literary history. A succinct "Preliminary Chapter" establishes the roots of seventeenth-century French publishing and book trade in the issues of the late sixteenth century, such as the Counter-Reformation, Catholic Revival, new wave of Humanism, and national literatures.

Martin covers the seventeenth-century French book trade in inordinately rich detail that is made possible by the data he gathered in his relentless twenty-year search for, and exposition of, the resources of French libraries and archives. His discussion of the social, religious, political, and literary contexts portrays them clearly as simultaneously shaping and being shaped by the book trade. Readers unfamiliar with this historical period will find themselves more fully informed when they have finished this book, but they should read it with an unabridged dictionary or encyclopedia at hand to explore such terms as patrology, clunian history, and ultramontaine. The inclusion of a glossary, chronological time line or table, fuller identification of individuals named, and a subject index would help nonspecialists use this book to greater advantage.

Martin professes his chief aim to be to "determine what interested the readers and writers of books, what their social background was, . . . what factors conditioned their reading habits," (45) and he is largely successful in doing so. Although his starting point is the book trade, there is something here for everyone interested in the history of books and reading, history of libraries, popular culture or "street literature," elite culture or "real" books (637), science libraries, children's science books, book dealers, and the personal/private libraries collected by government officials, royalty, professionals, and scholars.

Martin clearly views the seventeenth-century book as an emotive force. Will we someday be saying this about electronic media? Probably we will, considering

its mesmerizing advert. One foresees the publication of *Electronic Information Sources, Power, and People in 21st-Century United States*. Nevertheless, electronic media have not yet demonstrated the lasting, compelling, evocative powers of the book, which, as Martin confirms, has always been “more than an instrument of information and instruction . . .” (640).

Judith A. Overmier, *University of Oklahoma*

The French Press in the Age of Enlightenment. By Jack R. Censer. New York: Routledge, 1994. xi, 263 pp. \$59.95. ISBN 0-415-09730-4.

In his *Cultural Origins of the French Revolution*, Roger Chartier asks the question “do books make revolutions?” and answers with regard to the French Revolution: not necessarily and, if so, not directly. In this study of the eighteenth-century French periodical press (the qualifier “periodical” should have been included in the title), Jack Censer asks much the same question about French journalism and comes to much the same conclusion. He finds that, although French periodicals did direct bitter criticism at the crown during the period from the refusal of sacraments controversy to the Maupeou coup, they provided the monarchy with a relatively favorable press in the last years of the Old Regime—a pattern to which the author finds no exception. Censer acknowledges that the editorial focus on king and court preferred by the monarchy became blurred in the 1770s and 1780s by coverage of foreign democratic revolutions, which implicitly legitimized alternatives to absolutism. But just as he dissents from Jeremy Popkin’s notion of a pre-revolutionary shift toward revolutionary-style journalism, he contends that on the very eve of the revolution the monarchy was not only demonstrating public relations “strength,” but even enjoying a “revival.” In maintaining that late Old Regime periodicals expressed not hostility to but “satisfaction” with the crown, Censer’s study clearly complicates any explanation of the French Revolution premised on an increasingly antimonarchical public opinion (212).

Drawing from his own primary research and that of others, the author supports these provocative assertions with a synoptic examination of his subject, devoting separate chapters to the political press, the literary-philosophical press, the *petites-affiches*, the social composition of the journalistic profession, readership, and the wavering censorship and editorial policies of the monarchy. Limitations of space make it impossible to review Censer’s many fresh insights and findings here, but it can be said that the analysis is finely nuanced and demonstrates an impressive grasp of subject matter and sources. Although he sometimes imputes reader response to shifts in style and content that he does not and, perhaps, cannot substantiate, Censer captures well the muddled opinion that characterized so much of the late-eighteenth-century press—secular but not materialist, mildly pro-philosophe but not partisan, sharp with the crown for its abuses of power but not insurgent in spirit. The chapter on the *petites-affiches* is especially strong and flows much more smoothly than the rest of the book, which is unfortunately marred by tortured phrases an editor ought to have flagged and asked the author to eliminate.

As for Censer’s most important and undoubtedly controversial point about the political impact of the periodical press, it is refreshing to see an eighteenth-

century historian avoid the usual teleological perspective wherein every development is viewed as a precipitant of 1789; and it is personally gratifying to find support for a notion I have frequently put forward, namely, that the monarchy was not a fixed target, but a participant in a dialogue with its critics. Yet one may question how much political boost the crown received from these periodicals, even if they were not particularly hostile in slant or revolutionary in form. In the case of late-eighteenth-century foreign affairs, as Bailey Stone has recently emphasized, most news, except for the French-supported American Revolution, was bad news for the monarchy, and reporting it could hardly have enhanced the regime's prestige. Moreover, the periodical press did not function in a media vacuum. Its messages blended in the formation of public opinion with those of other print media, notably pamphlets and books, and with those communicated orally by political songs, jokes, and gossip. Censer's finding that the periodical press was more proroyalist than often assumed is certainly worth noting; but if, as Jeremy Popkin has argued, pamphlets interpreted the news that the periodical press reported, no firm determination regarding the contemporary political meaning of periodical reportage can be reached by focusing on it alone, as this study does. Such limitations aside, this study is an indispensable guide to the news the French Enlightenment thought fit to print and will be of interest and use to both specialists and nonspecialists in the field of journalism.

Thomas E. Kaiser, University of Arkansas at Little Rock

Les Imprimés Limousins, 1788–1799. Edited by Michel Cassan and Jean Boutier. Limoges: PULIM, 1994. xvii, 734 pp. ISBN 2-910026-18-8.

Scholars customarily have called the Old Regime province of Limousin—contiguous with the revolutionary departments of Haute-Vienne, Corrèze, and Creuse—the most “backward” region of France. What scholars have meant, pejoratively or not, was that this area participated relatively little in the economic and intellectual transformation that shaped modern France. Consequently, studying Limousin provides something of a lower limit on the extent of the arrival of “modernity.” In particular, for the nineteenth century, eminent scholars such as Alain Corbin and John Merriman have explored this aspect of this area of the Massif central. Some of the attraction of the volume considered here, it seems to me, is that it too can provide, this time for the 1700s, similar insights. In this case Limousin is used as a baseline for the penetration of literate culture in this earlier period.

Les Imprimés limousins, although at times self-consciously relying on the backwardness of the region, mainly pursues other goals and utilizes a variety of different approaches. Two-thirds of the book consists of an inventory of materials published in Limousin during the Revolution. The result of an exhaustive search which included the British Library and the U.S. National Union Catalog, this compilation is extremely impressive and difficult to rival for any province. Consisting of just under three thousand entries, this checklist provides for each item its title, publication information, physical size and length, subject classification, and a great deal of annotation.

Seven articles comprise the remainder of the volume whose contents often bear—intentionally or otherwise—on questions about the levels of traditionalism and modernity in Limousin. Despite the book's title, the first and longest essay

concerns the Old Regime and sets the stage for comparison with the findings about the Revolution. This analysis challenges, at least to some extent, the most negative stereotypes of Limoges traditionalism. Before 1789 local publishers mainly produced material for schools, church, and administrative units, and most readers encountered little that challenged authority of any kind. Still, the Limousin publications appeared in impressive quantities. There was some trade in challenging works, for example, books by the philosophes, and there was a small elite to collect them. A dynamic existed that promised further change. Consequently, as the book explicitly asserts, even in benighted Limousin the Old Regime was withering. I would add that, nonetheless, the rest of the country was moving along even faster.

Such discoveries about the period before 1789 will not, it seems to me, surprise revisionist scholars who see no connection between social structures and ideology. Finding advanced ideas in the absence of social change would not disturb these historians. Still their opponents would point out that the limited economic development did weaken intellectual advance.

Other pieces do not directly probe the theme of Limousin as a backwater and lower indicator, but their discoveries can be pushed in that direction. Perhaps the best article in the collection, "L'Imprimé limousin sous la Révolution" by Michel Cassan, uses the inventory as a beginning to evaluate thoroughly what transpired during the Revolution. After 1789 the production of works for traditional bodies like the church and schools completely evaporated, to be replaced by an avalanche of materials issuing from various levels of the revolutionary government. As Carla Hesse has already noted for the national picture, this meant the end of traditional culture with more vulnerable, topical sheets replacing bound texts that publishers often repeatedly reproduced over a long span of time. Although representing an assault on the Old Regime, this change to ephemeral productions overall supported revolutionary governments, substituting their discourse for their predecessors'. In addition, Limousin also published extraordinarily little directly representative of public opinion. Just as before 1789, seemingly only a small local elite participated in a discussion of political developments.

Cassan argues that the rise of administrative publishing, despite a laggardly local and possibly alternative voice, still signals the changeover from a relatively decentralized, traditional society to a revolutionary one, albeit without the political maelstrom of the capital and other cities. If one uses Limousin as a litmus test for weak change—something that Cassan does not do—one may conclude that at the least France experienced a powerful, expanded effort of government to seize the "word." Of course, the same perspective also suggests more resistance elsewhere, but could individuals stand up against the state? This collection of local studies, holding interesting implications, also includes one general theoretical account by Frédéric Barbier, who deals provocatively with some similar questions but with little reference to Limousin. In this work the author argues that the Revolution was part of a broader trend, beginning with the Enlightenment, that saw the establishment of a large print market and industry. Although extremely thoughtful, this article coexists somewhat uncomfortably with the local studies which emphasize the rupture introduced by the Revolution. In another way the essays clash, as Barbier clearly describes an extent of change that would relate better to another region.

Cultures of Letters: Scenes of Reading and Writing in Nineteenth-Century America. By Richard H. Brodhead. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993. ix, 245 pp. \$24.95. ISBN 0-226-07525-7.

Nineteenth-Century Women Learn to Write. Edited by Catherine Hobbs. Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1995. xv, 343 pp. \$47.50. ISBN 0-8139-1605-4.

These two volumes (constituting for this reviewer a fortuitous pairing) produce a strong first impression of novelty, of the unfamiliarity of the texts and historical niches explored. This freshness affords us the considerable pleasure of witnessing keen minds forging ideas from vivid perceptions. The authors take advantage of the fact that one's reactions to the unfamiliar are almost inevitably sharper, and much more likely to have the spark of originality to them, than responses to familiar subjects, which tend to resist new insights. (The critical mind has freer reign with, say, a first novel than with *Hamlet*.) These writers generally succeed in evoking recondite subject matter and in generating intriguing observations about it. But at their best, the authors go beyond this achievement, applying new formulations to more familiar texts and historical contexts, thereby illuminating them in a manner otherwise not easily accomplished. The result is a gratifying adventure in empirical thinking. This process often engenders fascinating and even surprising connections. Moreover, both volumes are accessible, not jargon-laden or ideologically skewed, yet up-to-date on current literary theory and practice. The hypotheses that emerge gain sophistication by being deployed more as processes than as products. Finally, both sets of authors are aware of what feminism and attention to African-American experiences can bring to their shared field of study.

From the outset of his undertaking, Richard H. Brodhead declares that "writing is always an acculturated activity" (8). *Cultures of Letters* seeks above all else to demonstrate the following assessment:

A work of writing comes to its particular form of existence in interaction with the network of relations that surround it: in any actual instance, writing orients itself in or against some understanding of what writing is, does, and is good for that is culturally composed and derived.

In essence, Brodhead wants to produce or contribute to "a history of literature's working conditions." Calling for and himself exemplifying a new American literary-social history, he recognizes the complex interaction among the individual writing, the social context which feeds that writing, and the demands and influences of the reading-publishing public. Overall, the scope of this text allows the author to examine a series of nineteenth-century American reading-writing "scenes" centered around the antebellum domestic novel, Nathaniel Hawthorne's *Blithedale Romance* (1851–1852), Louisa May Alcott's postbellum popular fiction, Sarah Orne Jewett's regional writing, and Charles W. Chesnut's Southern "local-color" stories.

In order to explore the interaction of societal forces and texts and the literary cultures they create, Brodhead performs historical as well as literary excavation, highlighting the areas of society which directly touch on literature and image-making, as well as the areas where literature comments directly on society. As a result of this thorough-going approach, the reader tends not to resist the connections Brodhead makes as the author finds himself "letting history qualify

theory" (10). Brodhead then presents his findings through crystallized historical moments or "scenes," using an armamentarium of different directional strategies to work out their implications. Probably the most fertile nexus for his purposes is that of genre. At the same time, this approach yields surprising instances of psychological insight. One of the advantages of Brodhead's fluid theory of interactive causation is the freedom of logical movement it allows him. For example, in chapter one he traces the linkage from the antislavery movement, through its generalization into attitudes and theories about corporal punishment, to the crystallization of these attitudes in the genre of the domestic novel. In contrast, chapter two reverses that direction, beginning with a single image from Hawthorne and moving into its repercussions in the social context, specifically by acknowledging the intense ambivalence about public-private conjunctions for women at midcentury.

Brodhead's third chapter strikes out on another path, moving from Alcott's personal/ social "constitution" to market conditions, to show how she found her place by utilizing the "domestic-tutelary" model of writing that fed into the new genre of the "girl's book" (85). In this chapter, the strategy is to stay focused on a single author. The directional strategy of chapter four, however, is downward, as Brodhead traces the surprising genesis of regional fiction in the demands of the new cultural elite, which seeks to satisfy "a certain socially based appetite for underdevelopment" (138). It is in this chapter that Brodhead addresses and critiques the questions of and claims for canonicity. His last three chapters seek to demonstrate the following conclusion: "In American literature in the second half of the nineteenth century, regional fiction presents an especially instructive instance of the history of literary opportunity" (115). Chapters five and six thus play out the implications of chapter four in the specific examples of Jewett and Chesnut: Jewett's case can teach us about not just New England but women's writing in general, and Chesnut's literary career can tell us precisely how readers and publishers "co-conspired" to confine the image of the African American to formulaic containment.

Perhaps one could argue that Brodhead is stacking the cards with his choices. For example, one might wonder how he would fit, say, *Moby Dick* (1851) into the context of his theory. But answers here are readily forthcoming—in the context of discipline and fiction, he might well argue that the examination of such a novel would further confirm his discoveries. Another potential criticism I can foresee is that the already brief afterword seems to end rather abruptly. Yet in this respect it is clear that Brodhead's Chesnut material has been newly excavated and in turn has two other venues of presentation, namely his concurrent editions of *The Conjure Woman, and Other Conjure Tales* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1993) and *The Journals of Charles W. Chesnut* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1993). A final possible weakness that I can "conjure" up might lie in the charge that Brodhead repeats himself a bit by reasserting at different stages and from different angles his key contentions. Within each specific context, however, I would argue that he needs to be reasserting his points, especially as they effect such startling new readings of and insights into the American literary scene. At end point, his case is a solid one and simply needs no further reiteration.

In *Nineteenth-Century Women Learn to Write*, Catherine Hobbs has assembled more than a dozen contributors to examine yet another set of relatively unfamiliar scenes from American history and literature. Under examination by this all-female cast of writers is a panoply of almost "exotic" texts, including, among others, conduct books, women-authored hymn lyrics, and unpublished daily

college essays buried in long-forgotten archives. Thus, this collection creates a self-designed conjunction of contemporary women and the writings of the nineteenth-century women they are bringing to light. Admittedly mostly white and middle-class in their authorship and subject matter, these contributors nonetheless speak to and find ties with other ethnicities and classes. Coming together as they do in this volume, they seek to show how women are “shaped” and in turn shape themselves through reading, writing, and eventually speaking out. The writings that Hobbs and her contributors explore can be characterized by their “contained sociality”; that is, these primary texts found a semipublic forum, yet at the same time they underscore women’s limited frame of address. These are writings which feature women in peculiarly constricting—or at least very narrow—social contexts, but although they are very focused public documents, they also have implications that cross multiple boundaries of expression and communication. This volume therefore assumes a recovery mode, performing a series of almost anthropological or ethnographic acts as the contributors unearth these texts and begin to compensate for their lack of exposure. And as we witness how nineteenth-century women tried to fit into society and yet find their own voices, we begin to read a subtext of covert communication.

Hobbs’s introductory chapter, “Cultures and Practices of U.S. Women’s Literacy,” accomplishes much more than one expects of an introduction; it truly pulls together and puts into broader context the volume’s central topics of gender and education, themselves background to the suffrage movement. In the words of Carroll Smith-Rosenberg, who contributed the foreword, Hobbs writes “thick feminist social history” (xi), in effect constructing a history of female education in the nineteenth century. Hobbs’s definition of literacy is worth citing at this point: “Literacy in its broadest sense denotes not only the technical skills of reading and writing but the tactical—or rhetorical—knowledge of how to employ those skills in the context of one or more communities” (1). In this respect, Hobbs notes literacy’s double-edged sword of social control and social reform (10), going on to observe that “75 percent of U.S. libraries were begun by women’s groups” (17). Her choice of an afterword is also telling. In this context, in “Revealing the Ties That Bind,” JoAnn Campbell informs us of the genesis of this collection at a conference on the history and historiography of rhetoric when a group of women scholars found themselves united by their “exclusion from the center of action” (303). Thus, it is not surprising to discover that Hobbs and many of her contributors organize their chapters through a logic that acknowledges oppositional forces, confirming once again that past battles long assumed to have been won still need to be fought in the present.

Some of the chapters—especially those in the second half—may strike the reader at first as almost too particularized, yet the degree and ease with which these closely examined spheres connect with earlier chapters and with the book’s themes as a whole can reinforce our perception that they constitute a valuable contribution. Overall, I suspect I found Part I, “Cultures and Contexts of Literacy,” stronger and more daring in the contributors’ critical reaches. These authors include Jane E. Rose (conduct books for women), Vickie Ricks (women’s college curricula), Sandra D. Harmon (women at the Illinois State Normal University), Devon A. Mihesuah (Cherokee female seminarians), June Hadden Hobbs (female vs. male hymnody), and Nicole Tonkovich (Harriet Beecher Stowe and the Semi-Colon Club). Part II, “Practices and ‘Voices’ of Literacy,” involves a focus on more preliminary research material and hence can only be more piecemeal in its claims. Some of these chapters seem a bit uneven; Maryan Wherry’s contribution (Elizabeth Bacon Custer and the

military frontier), for example, becomes rather repetitious. Other contributors to this section include Shirley Wilson Logan (social action of African American women), Judy Nolte Temple and Suzanne L. Bunkers (mother and daughter diaries), P. Joyce Rouse ("colonization" and female education), Heidemarie Z. Weidner (rhetoric options for an 1860 Butler University graduate), and Sue Carter Simmons (Radcliffe women and Harvard rhetoric instruction). Ultimately, Hobbs's *Nineteenth-Century Women Learn to Write* provides a commendable follow-up to the direction in scholarship charted two years previously by Brodhead's *Cultures of Letters*.

Carol Hanbery MacKay, University of Texas at Austin

Cultural Crusaders: Women Librarians in the American West, 1900–1917. By Joanne E. Passet. Albuquerque, New Mexico: University of New Mexico Press, 1994. xix, 208 pp. \$40.00. ISBN 0-8263-1530-5.

In the early years of this century, when Teddy Roosevelt was president, there was a call for individuals with energy, strength, and courage who could "ride . . . and pack a horse, follow a trail, shoot straight", (90) and journey alone through rough country, sometimes in the dead of night. These stalwart adventurers were not Roosevelt's "rough riders" but library "field workers" sent out by state librarians or commissions to foster library service in local communities in sparsely settled areas of the West. They are among the women Joanne Passet describes in *Cultural Crusaders: Women Librarians in the American West 1900–1917*.

Graduates of the newly organized library schools, imbued with the Progressive Era spirit of reform and passion for library services, were eager to apply their new skills. Western towns, frequently populated by seekers of fortune or adventure, offered challenge and adventure to library pioneers. As towns developed and western women established homes and families, they began to seek expanded educational and cultural opportunities, offering a fertile field for library development. The librarians who responded to this challenge, often lonesome in this vast territory and desirous of compatible discourse and encouragement, corresponded with library school directors and colleagues. From these letters, as well as institutional and government archives and publications, directories, newspapers, and wonderful photographs, Passet has provided an overview of the librarians who ventured out west, including their family backgrounds (mostly middle-class, white-collar), their reading habits and education, their modes of travel and living arrangements (some took a widowed parent west with them), the conditions they encountered, and the work they accomplished. The book also includes sketches of four representative women.

Like their eastern counterparts, western librarians saw library service as an instrument of culture and reform. The West, with its limitless vistas, as much a state of mind as a location, offered an opportunity for the enterprising librarian to fulfill her missionary intent while escaping the emerging bureaucracy of the large eastern libraries. Recently graduated from library school, these women had the opportunity to live independently, set up their own libraries, and implement their own policies. In the more settled areas, after some initial time spent organizing their collections, public librarians were able to engage in library outreach and provide services to particular groups, such as children and immigrants.

Librarians in universities and normal schools encouraged public library development while also providing library services to teachers, members of women's clubs, miners, and others who lacked access to public libraries.

Many of these librarians believed that, through innovative library services, they could "uplift" the masses, bring individuals from foreign backgrounds into the dominant culture, and instill their version of morality and civic duty into fertile young minds, providing an alternative to the saloon or reform school. Like other progressive reformers, they were sufficiently convinced of their own cause that they were not concerned with charges or appearances of paternalism.

The book provides a glimpse of the everyday inconveniences of western life: the mud, dust, and wind, and, in some cases, rigorous travel and isolation. To these add the more usual frustrations of unorganized collections, the press of clerical duties, low salaries, inadequate funds, competition for scarce revenues, and idiosyncratic boards and officials. While not all librarians prospered, those who persevered were able to experience concrete accomplishment.

Passet dates the end of the golden age for western library pioneers with the American entrance into World War I, when many librarians shifted their energies to the war effort. Ironically, according to Passet, the very success of the founding generation was also its undoing. Once firmly established, the western libraries became patriarchal and bureaucratic. The Progressive Era came to an end. The generation that followed lacked the dedication to reform and vision of service that marked the early years of this century.

Passet has compiled an entertaining and informative depiction of the demands and rewards of missionary librarianship in its heyday. A window into the lives of unmarried working women in the American West, this book is a welcome addition to library history, women's history, and western history.

Catherine Shanley, Manhattan College

Black Dixie: Afro-Texan History and Culture in Houston. Edited by Howard Beeth and Cary D. Wintz. (Centennial Series of the Association of Former Students, Vol. 41.) College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1992. xiv, 294 pp. \$47.50. ISBN 0-89096-494-7.

Black Dixie: Afro-Texan History and Culture in Houston is a significant contribution to African-American historiography in the United States. The book will be of special interest to those readers interested in African-American life in Houston. The book focuses on the Black experience in Houston from the Antebellum Era through the civil rights struggle of the twentieth century. The collection of eleven essays and two historical documents covers some of the most important aspects of the African-American experience in the Bayou City. Among the topics studied are those dealing with slavery and, in particular, the use and distribution of slave labor in Harris County, Texas, from 1836 to 1860, and the Reconstruction Era and its aftermath as it affected the social and economic lives of Blacks striving to gain a foothold in the new era of freedom. Other topics include the impact of segregation on the Black community in Houston and the civil rights movement in the twentieth century, housing problems for Blacks in contemporary Houston, race relations, and an overview of community organization as a means to effect change.

A book spanning a century and a half of history and such a wide range of topics might at first appear unwieldy. The book, however, is made coherent by its division into four sections with each section introduced by the editors, Howard Beeth and Cary D. Wintz. The introductory essays provide the reader with a chronological and historical context within the framework of Houston history. Each section of essays thus achieves a continuity of purpose. A brief opening introduction by Beeth is also noteworthy for its contribution to understanding the status of the study of local history in Houston, particularly that of African-American history. The introduction points out that historical studies until relatively recently have been sparse on Houston in general and particularly with regard to African Americans. Recent scholarship, Beeth asserts, has been stimulated by the city's favorably changing "physical and attitudinal conditions." Moreover, as he points out, there has been growing interest over the last two decades in local history at Rice University, Texas Southern University, and the University of Houston. One product of this interest has been the creation of the Houston Metropolitan Research Center of the Houston Public Library nearly twenty years ago. This institution has collected, preserved, and made available to researchers heretofore unavailable documentation of Houston's past, including numerous sources relating to African Americans in Houston. In fact, three of the articles appearing in *Black Dixie* were previously published in *The Houston Review*, a publication of the Houston Metropolitan Research Center. Another particularly well-written introduction establishes an excellent overview of Blacks in Houston from the Antebellum Period to the post-Civil War era and illustrates some of the uniqueness of Black life in the Lone Star State as well as its shared characteristics with the South.

A number of essays deserve special attention. Barry A. Crouch's "Seeking Equality: Houston Black Women during Reconstruction" sheds light on a subject which has not received the attention it merits. The essay, researched primarily from Freedman's Bureau records, demonstrates the determination of Black women during the Reconstruction years to establish their "social and economic rights." Their gains both in terms of the legal system and in the community at large proved precarious at best during the turbulent Reconstruction years. Yet, the efforts of Black women paved the way for a more stable lifestyle for themselves and their children. Likewise, James M. SoRelle's essay on the emergence of African-American businesses in Houston during the early twentieth century gives excellent insight into both the obstacles confronting Black entrepreneurs as well as their achievements. F. Kenneth Jensen's essay on the sit-in movement of the early 1960s explores an area which has until now been largely neglected. The contemporary subject of Black neighborhoods and Black housing problems is dealt with in Robert D. Bullard's excellent analysis accompanied by useful tables and statistics.

No review of this book would be complete without calling attention to the two documents which are used to complement the essays by viewing early-twentieth-century Houston with a Black perspective. The first, written by Black activist and newspaper publisher Clifton F. Richardson Sr., consists of a reprinted article from *Civics*, a progressive White magazine published in 1928. Richardson's article provides an overview of Black Houston in the 1920s, noting both accomplishments and glaring needs for improvements. Regarding the importance of Blacks to the Bayou City's well-being, he concludes that "Houston's colored citizenry constitute an important and integral part of our heterogeneous and polyglot population." An even more penetrating picture of Black Houston is given by Lorenzo J. Greene who visited the city in 1930. A native of Connecticut with a

Ph.D. from Columbia University, Greene wrote as an outsider, providing insightful comments on Black life in Houston and a personal view of a number of its prominent citizens whom he met during his visit. This article was extracted from Greene's diary which is presently in preparation for publication.

Successfully compiling a coherent, well-organized series of articles for a book encompassing nearly two centuries of history is no insignificant triumph. While *Black Dixie* is not intended to be the final word on African Americans in Houston, the book is a major contribution for its effort to fill in a major gap in the city's history. Beeth and Wintz's efforts should encourage other scholars to build on their foundation.

Louis J. Marchiafava, Houston Public Library

Ambition, Discrimination, and Censorship in Libraries. By Jefferson P. Selth. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland & Co., 1993. vii, 152 pp. \$20.95 (paper). ISBN 0-89950-883-9.

Ambition, Discrimination, and Censorship in Libraries is a disappointing collection of essays. Actually the first half of the eight chapters, two-thirds of the book, is devoted to selective analyses of a discrimination/ambition questionnaire that Selth and a colleague mailed out to about one thousand ALA members in 1992. Chapters five and six are essays on intellectual freedom; chapter seven, a dabble in film collection building; and chapter eight, tips on economizing on lodging at conferences. All in all, this is a rather bizarre conflation of professional observations held together only by the thread of autobiography.

Jeff Selth is an odd mix—aren't we all?—of a transplanted Australian Unitarian minister who was an academic librarian before and after his eight-year hiatus in the ministry. From empirical observations over his final tenure at the University of California libraries, he concluded that women in librarianship were more ambitious than their (fewer) male coworkers, who tended to find a specialization and stick with it rather than seek the power and, ostensibly, the greater financial rewards of management. Tangentially he also wondered about other forms of discrimination in the library workplace apart from the prevalent, and narrowly researched, male/female one.

So Selth found a politically opposite collaborator, Joyce Lenoir, a female, non-Caucasian public librarian, to help formulate a questionnaire containing a mere twenty-three multiple-choice questions in four categories (demographic, professional, goals, and discrimination), also allowing respondents the opportunity for elaboration. Ostensibly focusing on the broader topic of discrimination, the questionnaire also slipped in four questions on goals (i.e., ambition) to address Selth's primary interest in validating the male/female dichotomy of professional goals.

The results are ambiguous. First, while Selth claims that his survey proves the existence of other forms of discrimination, the actual numbers show a bit of overreaching in drawing conclusions. According to the Selth/Lenoir study the perception of discrimination, in descending order by type, is against gender, age, appearance, race, sexual preferences, and disabilities, but the actual reported figures of prejudice against respondents or against their coworkers placed gender solidly at the top, with family status the interesting second on the respondent list and race the second most observed form of discrimination on the colleague list. Still, overall quantities are low—only thirteen respondents claimed to have

received prejudicial treatment based on their marital/child status—and conclusions are tenuous.

Second, the separate analysis of the ambition questions, conveniently combined with the male/female demography established by question 1b, similarly produced debatable results. Less debatable, though, were the demographic combinations which inadvertently provided yet a third interpretation of the data from their one-page survey, a profile of ALA members.

From profiling librarians Selth moves on to a couple of intellectual freedom essays somewhat linked by a California Library Association scandal in 1984, wherein a Holocaust revisionist was denied a forum at the annual state conference, when the American Jewish Committee and state legislators brought pressure on the CLA to cancel the program. The first essay excoriates librarians who fail to meet the obligations stated in the Library Bill of Rights, of providing balanced collections which include all dissenting points of view, particularly on volatile social issues. These “ruthless” censors, as Selth calls them, echoing a friend’s epithet, undermine intellectual freedom by hiding behind the specious excuses of budgetary restraints or academic spuriousness. Intellectual freedom absolutism is also the topic of the essay “Waiting in the Wings,” adapted from a speech, in which Selth gives us an effective dismantling of Noel Peattie’s rationale for the “selective position” on censorship. The exception to defending everything comes, Peattie says, from the publication of lies. Selth is pretty convincing, relating several stories which repudiate the godlike authorities who condemn out of hand certain theories that they find morally reprehensible. Selth makes an impassioned plea for not letting censors get a foot in the door, especially when it is a librarian who is inviting entrance.

The last two essays are inconsequential. “The Critical Consensus” deals briefly with problems in building a basic film collection. Finally, “The Alternative Conferencegoer” relates the lesson of an impoverished librarian/minister who scraped by getting to conferences and made some friends along the way.

John Sigwald, Unger Memorial Library, Plainview, Texas

Research Libraries—Yesterday, Today, and Tomorrow. A Selection of Papers Presented at the International Seminars, Kanazawa Institute of Technology, Library Center, Kanazawa, Japan, 1982–1992. Edited by William J. Welsh. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1993. xii, 469 pp. \$95.00. ISBN 2-313-28966-2.

From 1982 to 1992, the state-of-the-art Library Center at Japan’s Kanazawa Institute of Technology hosted an International Seminar Program. “Notable scholars from all over the world” were invited to give papers on the past, present, and future of research libraries in order to “build bridges among librarians throughout the world” (xii).

This handsome indexed volume includes thirty-three of the sixty-three papers given at the decade-long seminar program. For this collection the editor has selected papers of particular interest to an American readership and organized them into seven major categories: “Research Libraries in the Twenty-First Century”; “Information Access in the New Era”; “New Technology, New Media, and Library Buildings”; “Library Education”; “Preservation of Research Materials”; “The Technological University Library”; and “Managing Knowledge in the Twenty-First Century.”

The result is a compelling international overview of the numerous issues confronting research libraries and librarians. Leaning neither towards Ludditism nor technophilia, the collection offers a balanced, often eloquent, analysis of professional challenges now and in the new millennium. Ultimately it appears that solutions will be found in a combination of traditional and innovative approaches.

Richard M. Dougherty, a past president of the American Library Association (ALA), convincingly addresses the heart of the matter:

progress . . . will be dictated by our ability to introduce and manage the new tools needed. The key will not be technological advances; technology has already outstripped the capacity of most organizations to pay for and structurally absorb the tools already available. Thus, progress is more likely to be gauged by our managerial prowess. . . . Librarians can serve to lead their institutions in achieving their preferred information futures. (58)

Research Libraries powerfully explodes a number of myths still pervasive in this era of limited growth and shrinking budgets. Futurists have, for instance, long been chanting the mantra that "the book is dead." In fact, "publishing on paper increases rather than declines" (4). The October 1995 issue of *Byte* magazine ran a lead story proclaiming that even "The PC is Dead." Several days later, however, a member of my health club sat happily reading a paperback novel under a dim light in the sauna. To me, this was graphic evidence that the book, which has survived numerous technological challenges in recent history, is alive and well in the real world.

There is also a widely held view that the library as a physical place is becoming irrelevant in an age of the electronic library. However, in our increasingly impersonal society,

people go to a library not only to obtain books, data, and information . . .
[but] in order to sit and communicate with people who also like to read. . . .
[A] library is part of the cultured environment of a human being and . . .
a human being with his various needs should be respected. (74)

Digitization is touted by some as the definitive solution to our so-called book problem. But, once again, the reality is that we simply cannot afford the technology on a universal scale; and, even if we could, there would be no economic incentive for digitizing many of our older titles. As a result, we are left with the daunting prospect of conserving hundreds of millions of decaying books worldwide. No wonder it is tempting to be distracted by the proliferation of "noninformation" (414) and the even more seductive phenomena of "edutainment" and "infotainment" (410).

The future of research libraries is clearly not paved with virtual gold. Perhaps, though, one can take some consolation from the fact that "the library we know now is an enterprise of enduring value and is the foundation on which the library of the future will be built" (108). There is undoubtedly a viable role for librarians in this endeavor. And whatever solutions we seek as information professionals, it will be essential to keep in mind that "the mission of libraries and librarians has changed hardly at all over the past 2,600 years. We collect information, we organize it, and we make it available to those who want it" (436).

Research Libraries offers much practical, as well as theoretical, insight into the future of the information profession and is essential reading for all academic librarians, research library directors, university administrators, and library school

faculty and students. This valuable collection of essays should be considered along with other recent titles in the field, such as Walt Crawford and Michael Gorman's *Future Libraries: Dreams, Madness & Reality* (Chicago: ALA, 1995) and William F. Birdsall's *The Myth of the Electronic Library: Librarianship and Social Change in America* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1994).

John D. Blackwell, Algoma University College, Ontario

An Index of Civilisation: Studies of Printing and Publishing History in Honour of Keith Maslen. Edited by Ross Harvey, Wallace Kirsop, and B. J. McMullin. Clayton, Victoria (Australia): Monash University, Centre for Bibliographical and Textual Studies, 1993. xvi, 249 pp. \$50.00. ISBN 0-7326-0467-2.

This handsome volume contains an homage to Keith Maslen (with a list of his publications); Maslen's "The Bowyer Ledgers: Retrospect and Prospect"; David McKitterick, "The Acceptable Face of Print"; Jim Mitchell, "Printers' Motives in Using False, Fictitious, or Misleading Imprints"; Brian Gerrard, "A New Taxonomy of Post-Impression Corrections"; Wallace Kirsop, "Paper-Quality Marks in Eighteenth-Century France"; J. McL. Emmerson, "The Publishing of Anthony Wood's *Historia et Antiquitates Universitatis Oxoniensis* (1674) and *Athenae Oxonienses* (1691-92)"; Harold Love, "The 'Comeorn' Scriptorium Revisited"; Paul Morgan, "Book-Sale Catalogues in Eighteenth-Century Warwickshire"; B. J. McMullin, "T. Johnson, Bookseller in The Hague"; J. C. Ross, "A Progress Report upon a Study of Samuel Palmer: A London Printer as Icarus"; Bryan Coleborne, "The Problem of 'Blue-Skin's Ballad'"; Hugh Amory, "'Proprietary Illustration': The Case of Cooke's *Tom Jones*"; Lorna J. Clark, "From Manuscript to Print: The Use of Physical Evidence in an Edition of Correspondence"; J. D. Fleeman, "Johnson in the Schoolroom: George Fulton's *Miniature Dictionary* (1821)"; Wallace Kirsop, "A Note on Johnson's *Dictionary* in Nineteenth-Century Australia and New Zealand"; Kathleen Coleridge, "Edward Catchpool, Master Printer in London and Wellington"; D. F. McKenzie, "Robert Coupland Harding on Design in Typography"; Ross Harvey, "Formula for Success: Economic Aspects of the Nineteenth-Century New Zealand Press"; and Roderick Cave, "An Uncommon Press in the Canterbury Museum." The book is crowned with a thorough index (nominum and rerum) by Rachel Salmond.

As the reader can tell by the enumeration of the articles, there is a wealth of information concerning a wide-ranging set of topics, with a decided emphasis on the Anglo-Saxon world, especially England and Australia-New Zealand. The twenty studies aptly begin with Maslen's interesting coup-d'oeil on the Bowyer printing-house ledgers, published by himself and John Lancaster just a few years ago, a book that set new standards for such works. Maslen provides a number of insights which help illuminate some ways that books can be put to use by scholars in the future. With well over five thousand items printed by the Bowyer firm (1710-1777), the ledgers are a mine of information of all sorts which can be put to many different kinds of use.

The studies focusing on "down under" by Kirsop, Coleridge, McKenzie, Harvey, and, to some extent, Cave, add to our knowledge, in pointillist fashion, of printing and publishing in Australia and New Zealand, primarily in the nineteenth century. Indeed, among a number of tidbits, we learn that a common press which Poisson, a printer in Caen (from good burgher stock and a member

of a printing dynasty), did not need was donated to Jean-François Yvert and subsequently sent halfway around the world to New Zealand to be used by the Catholic mission in the Bay of Islands. It then found a home in San Francisco and was busy churning out issues of the *Journal of Commerce* in 1850 (Cave, 223). That study is largely a series of notes on portable presses, especially in the nineteenth century and, more specifically, on one in Canterbury. As an aside, it might be mentioned that portable presses existed in the eighteenth century which the French government, suffering from its usual paranoia, made every effort to eradicate.

Several studies are centered on the eighteenth century. In a few concise pages, Gerrard treats us to a classification system of the kinds of corrections made after the printing of a book; a summary is provided at the end, together with five high-quality illustrations.

Kirsop reminds us that special marks were used in France to differentiate special-paper copies from those printed on ordinary paper. A series of notes round out the study and make of it an "état présent" on the subject.

McMullin explores the world of a bookseller established in The Hague, Thomas Johnson, opening new avenues of research. He concludes that "a more exhaustive study might profitably be undertaken of his editorial activities—if my samples are typical of his editorial activities, he deserves more attention than modern-day editors are likely to accord him."

Mitchell continues to profit from his experience at the ESTC with a study concerned with why printers/publishers used false imprints. However, what seem like countless French books bore false (or semifalse) imprints to satisfy exigencies of publishing books by virtue of the special "permission tacite," especially after 1750. (There are other links between false imprints and the implementation of the rules that regulated the French book trade under the Old Order.) The tacit permit ended with the demise of the book-trade administration in 1790, and so, logically, did certain kinds of false imprints. And, contrary to what is stated, press figures were used in France, albeit rarely. But Mitchell's is a well thought out, absorbing article which any reader will find of considerable interest.

There is much more to say about this book, all of it good, including the elegant presentation. There is material here to interest all students of "l'histoire du livre" in many countries. The author of this review is happy to report that the history of the book is alive and doing very well indeed, "down under."

Robert L. Dawson, University of Texas, Austin

Slavic and Baltic Library Resources at the New York Public Library: A First History and Practical Guide. By Robert H. Davis Jr., with a preface by the Hon. George Frost Kennan. New York: New York Public Library and Los Angeles: Charles Schlacks Jr., 1994. xviii, 173 pp. \$12.95 (paper). ISBN 0-87104-4438-2.

A major factor in the burgeoning of Slavic collections in the United States during the twentieth century has been the revolutionary growth of interest in Russia and Eastern Europe on the part of native-born Americans and American institutions. As George Kennan reminds us in his graceful preface to this useful scholarly history, the upheavals of the twentieth century brought home to millions of Americans the "extent to which their own fate is linked to that of the peoples of Russia and Eastern Europe" (vii). There is no non-Eastern European

country where they subsume so much attention as in the United States and its academic establishments. While much of this interest came after World War II (Harvard's Slavic collection had only 18,350 titles in 1927, and as late as 1946 the University of Illinois reported only 1,790 Slavic holdings), it has been possible throughout most of the century to do advanced research in Eastern European studies at three American libraries.

The largest of these collections is at the Library of Congress, which in 1906 bought the eighty thousand-volume library of Siberian merchant G. V. Yudin, a recent description of which, by I. A. Polovnikova, was reviewed in these pages last year (see *Istoriia Bibliotek Dorevoliutsionnoi Rossii*, in *Libraries and Culture* 30:4 [Fall 1995], 440). Another Slavic collection of long standing and great depth is that of War, Revolution and Peace at the Hoover Institution at Stanford, California, dating from the extraordinary collection activities of Stanford Russian history professor Frank Golder inside the Soviet Union in the 1920s (see Terence Emmons and Bertrand M. Patenaude, eds., *War, Revolution and Peace in Russia: The Passages of Frank Golder 1914–1927* [Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 1992]). But the oldest and probably the most used of the great American Slavic collections is that of The New York Public Library, second in size only to that of the Library of Congress. With some of its titles deriving from the Astor and Lenox collections from which it descended, The New York Public Library's Russian Department was organized in 1899 and by 1917 already had 25,000 Slavic titles.

The great virtue of Robert H. Davis's history of this collection is that its development is always explained in reference to the socio-cultural world of which it was a part. Both Kennan and Davis understand the importance to the collection's growth of its unique location and user population and of the politically charged nature of its contents. By 1920, at which time the United States counted only eighteen native Ph.D.'s in Eastern European or Russian history, the Russian Department at The New York Public Library had already for several decades served the émigré communities from Tsarist and Soviet Russia mushrooming around the port of New York. Social Democrats Leon Trotsky, N. I. Bukharin, and L. G. Deutsch were all readers in the department while in New York exile before 1917. From the years just after the Russian revolution,

tales have come down to us of scenes when the exiled Russian Social Democrats and Socialist Revolutionaries, occupying their different tables in the Reading Room, would glare at each other across the room in quivering hostility and mount sudden sallies to snatch a copy of the latest Moscow newspaper from those at the other table. (viii)

The fortunes of the Russian Department (later called the Slavonic Division) were always closely connected to international developments—whether it was the chaos of the post-Civil War Soviet Union, when the department's head, Avraham Yarmolinsky, travelled to Russia with his chief, Harry M. Lydenberg, to buy books in 1923–1924, or the Cold War's book import restrictions, or the present wilderness of the post-Soviet marketplace. The travails of the Slavonic Division, particularly the periodic onslaughts upon its contents by anticommunist vigilantes, make for exciting reading.

The author has affixed to his (inevitably) interesting narrative an impressive scholarly apparatus, important far beyond the narrow realm of Slavic collection development. Students of international scholarly communication and of American and New York City cultural history will all profit from Robert Davis's work, which library historians can use as an example of how descriptions of collections'

growth can be transformed into scientific (i.e., explanatory) histories telling us *why* libraries take the form they do, rather than simply *how*.

Pamela Spence Richards, Rutgers University

Teaching Bibliographic Skills in History: A Sourcebook for Historians and Librarians. Edited by Charles A. D'Aniello. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1993. xviii, 385 pp. \$65.00. ISBN 0-313-25266-1.

Libraries and archives are the laboratories of historians. But how do fledgling historians learn to use those labs? If they are lucky, they receive guidance from a teacher/librarian who has perused this volume edited by longtime history bibliographer Charles D'Aniello.

Rather than offering yet another list of history reference tools or one more step-by-step bibliographic instruction program, this work means to inspire new ideas in historians and librarians responsible for helping students learn how to research historical topics. D'Aniello's method for accomplishing that goal is to gather essays from a notable group of historians, archivists, and librarians who tackle a number of relevant topics.

Four parts comprise the book. The first part consists of two articles discussing historical methods and the growing interdisciplinarity of the historical field. Historians may skip these contributions from their fellow members of the guild, but librarians will profit from these glimpses into the historian's mind.

The book's second part focuses on instruction, opening with Jane A. Rosenberg and Robert P. Swierenga's overview of historians' information-seeking behavior and the differences between historians' and history students' research efforts. History professor Swierenga follows up with an account of his approach to teaching a graduate research methods course. D'Aniello rounds out the second part with a thorough discussion of how to go about teaching bibliographic research skills to those engaged in historical research. He includes sample assignments to help students master the essentials.

More specialized chapters on various kinds of reference tools, including a separate offering on electronic information sources, make up Part III. A highlight of this section is Trudy Huskamp Peterson's thorough yet clear explanation of archival and manuscript collection finding aids. Another helpful chapter comes from Raymond G. McInnis, a librarian and historian, who discusses social sciences and humanities reference sources for researchers engaged in the pursuit of interdisciplinary topics.

The final part consists entirely of D'Aniello's well-selected bibliography of books and articles for the librarian and/or historian embarking on a project to teach library research skills. The bibliography's fourteen sections, from "General Ideas, Issues, and Assumptions" to "Ethical and Intellectual Issues in Documenting Historical Research," ensure quick identification of relevant material. The annotations summarize each item's key points and so are informative in and of themselves.

The contributors to this volume offer an excellent starting point for librarians and historians intent on training students in the intelligent use of libraries and their resources. Their perspectives and wisdom are applicable beyond the field of history, especially given the discipline's own broad reach. For that reason, library and information science faculty teaching bibliographic instruction courses

should consider assigning this book, or selected parts of it, as required reading for graduate students planning careers as academic reference librarians or subject specialists.

Cheryl Knott Malone, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign

An Introduction to Bibliography for Literary Students. By Ronald B. McKerrow. New Castle, Del.: Oak Knoll Press, 1994. xxxvii, 359 pp. \$29.95. ISBN 1-884718-01-9.

A New Introduction to Bibliography. By Philip Gaskell. New Castle, Del.: Oak Knoll Press, 1995. xxiv, 438 pp. \$29.95. ISBN 1-884718-13-2.

Principles of Bibliographical Description. By Fredson Bowers. New Castle, Del.: Oak Knoll Press, 1994. xxv, 505 pp. \$29.95. ISBN 1-884718-00-0.

The Design of Bibliographies: Observations, References and Examples. By Sidney E. Berger. Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1992. ix, 198 pp. \$85.00. ISBN 0-313-28425-3.

It is indeed ironical that, just as scholars and librarians have found renewed interest in bibliographical matters (if we properly define bibliography in its broadest sense), formal training in bibliography should have all but disappeared from the university curriculum. Today many researchers are looking again in their work at the political and institutional facts of textual creation, production, distribution, and reception. There are many reasons for this: the rise of the history of the book as a discipline dedicated to exploring the social impact of manuscript and printed texts, the widespread interest in redefining the canon to incorporate texts by those who have previously been considered outside the cultural mainstream, the concern of “new historicists” to uncover the original context and meanings of particular texts in all their individual richness, and the challenges of multitudinous new forms of digital and electronic texts to our understanding of the nature and proper management of all texts. Meanwhile traditional courses introducing bibliographical theory and methods have been dropped from most graduate programs in literature and library science. For this reason Oak Knoll Press is to be congratulated for bringing three twentieth-century bibliographical classics back into print in paperback so that they can be used by students, librarians, and scholars alike.

The Anglo-American tradition of modern bibliographical and textual studies—what has often been referred to as the “new bibliography”—was built during the first half of this century around principles enunciated chiefly by three Englishmen, A. W. Pollard, R. B. McKerrow, and W. W. Greg. Although their scholarly work focused on early printed texts, especially literary and dramatic texts of the English renaissance, the underlying understanding that they brought to their work had implications for textual scholarship more broadly. McKerrow’s *Introduction to Bibliography for Literary Students* (first published in 1927, expanding on his earlier “Notes on Bibliographical Evidence for Literary Students and Editors of English Works of the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries,” which had appeared in the Bibliographical Society’s *Transactions* for 1912–1913) synthesized these principles and provided a masterful survey of the field. While it is in one sense out-of-date, largely focused on literary texts printed during the hand press

period and unenriched by the vast amount of bibliographical scholarship that has been accomplished since its publication, this text is still in many ways the best introduction to the field. McKerrow writes with great warmth and full understanding of why and how bibliography counts: his statements on a topic may be brief or incomplete and may not fully reflect current scholarly knowledge, but they always seem to bring out just that which is important or interesting.

David McKitterick's introduction to this reprint usefully describes the social milieu from which the "new bibliography" and McKerrow's work arose and points to the limited focus of that work and to the areas where subsequent bibliographical research has superseded or expanded on McKerrow's discussion. McKitterick also points to the relation between McKerrow's book and Philip Gaskell's *A New Introduction to Bibliography*, first published in 1972 and now also reprinted by Oak Knoll Press. Although Gaskell states clearly in his "Preface" that his work is intended to be "a new book, not a revision of McKerrow" (vii), the two works share similar titles and similar goals in aiming "to elucidate the transmission of texts by explaining the processes of book production" (vii). Gaskell expands his focus beyond the literary, incorporates the lessons of the nearly fifty years of active bibliographical scholarship that followed the publication of McKerrow's work, especially drawing on the lessons learned from the study of surviving archives of book trade firms, and dedicates roughly a third of his book to a systematic account of book production and publication during the industrial era from about 1800 to 1950. The resulting book is concise, broad-ranging, accurate, and useful. But as indispensable as it is as a source of information, it lacks the engagement and humanity everywhere present in McKerrow that makes the earlier work, in many ways, still the best text for students starting out in the field.

Fredson Bowers's *Principles of Bibliographical Description*, first published in 1949, signalled the postwar shift of much bibliographical energy and activity across the Atlantic as well as the emergence of a major figure, who was to become single-handedly the center of much of that energy and activity. As Bowers's first important bibliographical contribution—the first of many—*Principles* was and remains a remarkable achievement. Nevertheless it was, we learn from G. Thomas Tanselle's "Introduction" to this reprint, almost an accident, a by-product of one project Bowers began early and left incomplete at his death, a descriptive bibliography that would continue Greg's work on English pre-Restoration drama into the Restoration period. After surveying past descriptive *practice* in order to establish procedures for that project, Bowers went on to work out, enunciate, demonstrate, and justify a set of *principles* for describing printed books from the sixteenth to the twentieth centuries in a work that still stands as thorough, rigorous, and comprehensive. Tanselle's introduction gives a clear account of Bowers's accomplishment and points to newer or supplementary studies that call for small revisions to Bowers's practice or procedure (perhaps most usefully Tanselle's own "A Sample Bibliographical Description with Commentary" in *Studies in Bibliography* 40 [1987]: 1–30).

While modern scholars have again become interested in describing and interpreting the physical features of books and will certainly profit from Bowers's insights, it is unlikely that many would now share his firm conviction that "descriptive bibliography is one of the kinds of scholarship that may be described as 'pure' scholarship" (3). His sense that any bibliographical description could be comprehensive and neutral, could serve the needs of all scholars regardless of their ideological or critical stance, seems dated and overly positivistic. Similarly only a few of the descriptive bibliographies now being published follow Bowers's text in full detail or fully meet the standards he lays down—even Tanselle's

own "sample" description is remarkable for its lacunae. This fact emerges clearly from appendix one of Sidney E. Berger's *The Design of Bibliographies*, which prints facsimile example pages from thirty-five mostly recent bibliographies, only a very few of which seem to exhibit any awareness of or attempt to follow Bowers's *Principles*.

In many ways this appendix of facsimile pages is the most useful part of Berger's book, first published in England in 1991 and certainly not a classic. While Berger claims to intend "design of bibliographies" broadly to encompass both the physical and intellectual features of bibliographies of all sorts, his actual focus is largely on the typographical design of book lists and other forms of enumerative bibliography. The work is presented in four sections: four chapters of prose observations on bibliographical design (48 pages), an annotated bibliography listing 274 works mostly on book design and legibility (54 pages), the appendix of facsimile examples (87 pages), and a second appendix on legibility that reproduces the tabular summary of recommendations from a 1940 manual on typography (only 4 pages). This is an idiosyncratic book and suffers from the lack of careful editing that could have eliminated the many repetitions, irrelevancies, unnecessary strings of short quotations, and awkward sentences. It is also a highly personal book, reflecting and limited by Berger's own experience and taste in bibliography and design. There can be no accounting for taste, and while much stated here on bibliography and design is cogent and to the point, much also seems idiosyncratic if not silly. Together the three reprints from Oak Knoll Press do much to argue for and demonstrate the importance and continuing relevance of bibliography, while Berger's book in its design, both physical and intellectual, is curiously unconvincing.

Michael Winship, University of Texas at Austin